



ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Each reading program will be scored using a rubric. A response must meet **all** the criteria in each scored area to be included on the K-3 MOWR vetted reading program list. Peer Review will be noted but does not disqualify overall approval.

Study: [Effectiveness of the Superkids Reading Program in Pawtucket Public Schools Final Report on First Year Results](#)

Date of Study: December 21, 2012

Grade Levels of Study: K-2

Core Program's Marketed Name: Zaner Bloser SuperKids

	Rating or Measure Select: Y or N	Rationale
ESSA Evidence Tier	Y	Tier 2
Independent Researchers (Y/N)	Y	Kenneth Wong and Megan Boben
Established Measure (Y/N)	Y	DIBELS

Sample Size	Y	<table><caption>Table 1. Student Characteristics by Grade Level</caption><thead><tr><th></th><th>Pawtucket 2010-2011</th><th>Pawtucket 2011-2012</th><th>Providence 2011-2012</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td rowspan="8">Kindergarten</td><td>Total</td><td>792</td><td>794</td><td>850</td></tr><tr><td>Black</td><td>201 (26%)</td><td>209 (27%)</td><td>156 (18%)</td></tr><tr><td>Hispanic</td><td>227 (29%)</td><td>185 (24%)</td><td>506 (60%)</td></tr><tr><td>White</td><td>313 (40%)</td><td>361 (46%)</td><td>87 (10%)</td></tr><tr><td>Other</td><td>39 (5%)</td><td>29 (4%)</td><td>101 (12%)</td></tr><tr><td>Free/Reduced Price Lunch</td><td>648 (82%)</td><td>631 (79%)</td><td>771 (96%)</td></tr><tr><td>English Language Services</td><td>98 (13%)</td><td>95 (12%)</td><td>76 (9%)</td></tr><tr><td>Individualized Education Plan</td><td>94 (12%)</td><td>101 (13%)</td><td>105 (12%)</td></tr><tr><td rowspan="8">1st Grade</td><td>Total</td><td>798</td><td>804</td><td>814</td></tr><tr><td>Black</td><td>194 (24%)</td><td>218 (28%)</td><td>204 (25%)</td></tr><tr><td>Hispanic</td><td>213 (27%)</td><td>220 (28%)</td><td>420 (52%)</td></tr><tr><td>White</td><td>350 (44%)</td><td>320 (40%)</td><td>82 (10%)</td></tr><tr><td>Other</td><td>35 (4%)</td><td>33 (4%)</td><td>108 (13%)</td></tr><tr><td>Free/Reduced Price Lunch</td><td>642 (80%)</td><td>655 (81%)</td><td>748 (97%)</td></tr><tr><td>English Language Services</td><td>126 (16%)</td><td>119 (15%)</td><td>94 (12%)</td></tr><tr><td>Individualized Education Plan</td><td>102 (13%)</td><td>87 (11%)</td><td>117 (14%)</td></tr><tr><td rowspan="8">2nd Grade</td><td>Total</td><td>756</td><td>781</td><td>796</td></tr><tr><td>Black</td><td>193 (26%)</td><td>205 (26%)</td><td>204 (26%)</td></tr><tr><td>Hispanic</td><td>228 (30%)</td><td>202 (26%)</td><td>432 (54%)</td></tr><tr><td>White</td><td>296 (39%)</td><td>332 (43%)</td><td>76 (10%)</td></tr><tr><td>Other</td><td>35 (5%)</td><td>39 (5%)</td><td>84 (11%)</td></tr><tr><td>Free/Reduced Price Lunch</td><td>598 (79%)</td><td>632 (81%)</td><td>726 (97%)</td></tr><tr><td>English Language Services</td><td>153 (20%)</td><td>129 (17%)</td><td>91 (11%)</td></tr><tr><td>Individualized Education Plan</td><td>98 (13%)</td><td>105 (13%)</td><td>131 (16%)</td></tr></tbody></table>		Pawtucket 2010-2011	Pawtucket 2011-2012	Providence 2011-2012	Kindergarten	Total	792	794	850	Black	201 (26%)	209 (27%)	156 (18%)	Hispanic	227 (29%)	185 (24%)	506 (60%)	White	313 (40%)	361 (46%)	87 (10%)	Other	39 (5%)	29 (4%)	101 (12%)	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	648 (82%)	631 (79%)	771 (96%)	English Language Services	98 (13%)	95 (12%)	76 (9%)	Individualized Education Plan	94 (12%)	101 (13%)	105 (12%)	1 st Grade	Total	798	804	814	Black	194 (24%)	218 (28%)	204 (25%)	Hispanic	213 (27%)	220 (28%)	420 (52%)	White	350 (44%)	320 (40%)	82 (10%)	Other	35 (4%)	33 (4%)	108 (13%)	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	642 (80%)	655 (81%)	748 (97%)	English Language Services	126 (16%)	119 (15%)	94 (12%)	Individualized Education Plan	102 (13%)	87 (11%)	117 (14%)	2 nd Grade	Total	756	781	796	Black	193 (26%)	205 (26%)	204 (26%)	Hispanic	228 (30%)	202 (26%)	432 (54%)	White	296 (39%)	332 (43%)	76 (10%)	Other	35 (5%)	39 (5%)	84 (11%)	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	598 (79%)	632 (81%)	726 (97%)	English Language Services	153 (20%)	129 (17%)	91 (11%)	Individualized Education Plan	98 (13%)	105 (13%)	131 (16%)
	Pawtucket 2010-2011	Pawtucket 2011-2012	Providence 2011-2012																																																																																																						
Kindergarten	Total	792	794	850																																																																																																					
	Black	201 (26%)	209 (27%)	156 (18%)																																																																																																					
	Hispanic	227 (29%)	185 (24%)	506 (60%)																																																																																																					
	White	313 (40%)	361 (46%)	87 (10%)																																																																																																					
	Other	39 (5%)	29 (4%)	101 (12%)																																																																																																					
	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	648 (82%)	631 (79%)	771 (96%)																																																																																																					
	English Language Services	98 (13%)	95 (12%)	76 (9%)																																																																																																					
	Individualized Education Plan	94 (12%)	101 (13%)	105 (12%)																																																																																																					
1 st Grade	Total	798	804	814																																																																																																					
	Black	194 (24%)	218 (28%)	204 (25%)																																																																																																					
	Hispanic	213 (27%)	220 (28%)	420 (52%)																																																																																																					
	White	350 (44%)	320 (40%)	82 (10%)																																																																																																					
	Other	35 (4%)	33 (4%)	108 (13%)																																																																																																					
	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	642 (80%)	655 (81%)	748 (97%)																																																																																																					
	English Language Services	126 (16%)	119 (15%)	94 (12%)																																																																																																					
	Individualized Education Plan	102 (13%)	87 (11%)	117 (14%)																																																																																																					
2 nd Grade	Total	756	781	796																																																																																																					
	Black	193 (26%)	205 (26%)	204 (26%)																																																																																																					
	Hispanic	228 (30%)	202 (26%)	432 (54%)																																																																																																					
	White	296 (39%)	332 (43%)	76 (10%)																																																																																																					
	Other	35 (5%)	39 (5%)	84 (11%)																																																																																																					
	Free/Reduced Price Lunch	598 (79%)	632 (81%)	726 (97%)																																																																																																					
	English Language Services	153 (20%)	129 (17%)	91 (11%)																																																																																																					
	Individualized Education Plan	98 (13%)	105 (13%)	131 (16%)																																																																																																					
Research Design	Y	Regression analysis using a 3-level, cross-level hierarchical linear model (HLM) to account for the longitudinal nature of the test (level 1), individual student differences (level 2) and individual teacher differences (level 3)																																																																																																							
Outcome	Y	Our research clearly shows that Pawtucket students who went through the Superkids reading program outperformed their peers who did not receive the program in the previous year in Pawtucket as well as their peers in Providence public schools. Superkids also benefited minority students in reading improvement in Pawtucket. Appendix B has a summary of results of all the subtests listed in Table 4. A separate technical report provides the details on the statistical analysis on all the findings on reading effectiveness.																																																																																																							

Statistical Significance	Y- However, some specific subtests did not show statistical significance.	Table 5. Snapshot of Results <table><tr><th>DIBELS Next Test</th><th>Grade</th><th>Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Pawtucket 2010-2011</th><th>Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Providence 2011-2012</th></tr><tr><td>Kindergarten Composite</td><td>K</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.002)</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>First Sound Fluency (FSF)</td><td>K</td><td></td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.3114</td></tr><tr><td>Letter Naming Fluency (LNF)</td><td>K</td><td></td><td>- Overall (p-value=0.005) ES = 0.0796</td></tr><tr><td>Phoneme Segmentation Fluency (PSF)</td><td>K</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3401</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.6678</td></tr><tr><td>Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)</td><td>K</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2895</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2645</td></tr><tr><td>Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)</td><td>K</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3886</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4432</td></tr><tr><td>1st Grade Composite</td><td>1</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.048)</td><td>- Overall (p-value=0.008)</td></tr><tr><td>Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)</td><td>1</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.023) ES = 0.1698</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1973 + Black students (p-value=0.011) ES = 0.3666 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.026) ES = 0.2955</td></tr><tr><td>Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)</td><td>1</td><td></td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2825 + Black students (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.4253 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.045) ES = 0.2710</td></tr><tr><td>DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)</td><td>1</td><td></td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2547 + Black students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.5701 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4574</td></tr><tr><td>DORF Retell</td><td>1</td><td></td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.015) ES = 0.3335</td></tr></table> <table><tr><td>2nd Grade Composite</td><td>2</td><td>+ Overall⁴</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.036)</td></tr><tr><td>DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)</td><td>2</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.056</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.039) ES = 0.0288</td></tr><tr><td>DORF Retell</td><td>2</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1644</td><td>+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1944</td></tr><tr><td>Kindergarten Teacher Fidelity</td><td>K</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>1st Grade Teacher Fidelity</td><td>1</td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td>2nd Grade Teacher Fidelity</td><td>2</td><td></td><td></td></tr></table> Our research clearly shows that Pawtucket students who went through the Superkids reading program outperformed their peers who did not receive the program in the previous year in Pawtucket as well as their peers in Providence public schools. Superkids also benefited minority students in reading improvement in Pawtucket. Appendix B has a summary of results of all the subtests listed in Table 4. A separate technical report provides the details on the statistical analysis on all the findings on reading effectiveness. The following is used to interpret the labels in Table 5: <i>A blank space</i> means there were no statistically significant results to report <i>+ Overall</i> means that there was a statistically significant more positive change in the difference between the first and last test score in Pawtucket 2011-2012 (Superkids) that applies to the Superkids group as a whole. <i>- Overall</i> means that there was a statistically significant less positive change in the difference between the first and last test score in Pawtucket 2011-2012 (Superkids) that applies to the Superkids group as a whole.	DIBELS Next Test	Grade	Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Pawtucket 2010-2011	Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Providence 2011-2012	Kindergarten Composite	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.002)		First Sound Fluency (FSF)	K		+ Overall (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.3114	Letter Naming Fluency (LNF)	K		- Overall (p-value=0.005) ES = 0.0796	Phoneme Segmentation Fluency (PSF)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3401	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.6678	Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2895	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2645	Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3886	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4432	1 st Grade Composite	1	+ Overall (p-value=0.048)	- Overall (p-value=0.008)	Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)	1	+ Overall (p-value=0.023) ES = 0.1698	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1973 + Black students (p-value=0.011) ES = 0.3666 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.026) ES = 0.2955	Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2825 + Black students (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.4253 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.045) ES = 0.2710	DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2547 + Black students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.5701 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4574	DORF Retell	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.015) ES = 0.3335	2 nd Grade Composite	2	+ Overall ⁴	+ Overall (p-value=0.036)	DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)	2	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.056	+ Overall (p-value=0.039) ES = 0.0288	DORF Retell	2	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1644	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1944	Kindergarten Teacher Fidelity	K			1 st Grade Teacher Fidelity	1			2 nd Grade Teacher Fidelity	2		
DIBELS Next Test	Grade	Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Pawtucket 2010-2011	Pawtucket 2011-2012 compared to Providence 2011-2012																																																																							
Kindergarten Composite	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.002)																																																																								
First Sound Fluency (FSF)	K		+ Overall (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.3114																																																																							
Letter Naming Fluency (LNF)	K		- Overall (p-value=0.005) ES = 0.0796																																																																							
Phoneme Segmentation Fluency (PSF)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3401	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.6678																																																																							
Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2895	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2645																																																																							
Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)	K	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.3886	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4432																																																																							
1 st Grade Composite	1	+ Overall (p-value=0.048)	- Overall (p-value=0.008)																																																																							
Nonsense Word Fluency Correct Letter Sounds (NWF CLS)	1	+ Overall (p-value=0.023) ES = 0.1698	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1973 + Black students (p-value=0.011) ES = 0.3666 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.026) ES = 0.2955																																																																							
Nonsense Word Fluency Whole Words Read (NWF WWR)	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2825 + Black students (p-value=0.003) ES = 0.4253 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.045) ES = 0.2710																																																																							
DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.2547 + Black students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.5701 + Hispanic students (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.4574																																																																							
DORF Retell	1		+ Overall (p-value=0.015) ES = 0.3335																																																																							
2 nd Grade Composite	2	+ Overall ⁴	+ Overall (p-value=0.036)																																																																							
DIBELS Oral Reading Fluency (DORF)	2	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.056	+ Overall (p-value=0.039) ES = 0.0288																																																																							
DORF Retell	2	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1644	+ Overall (p-value=0.000) ES = 0.1944																																																																							
Kindergarten Teacher Fidelity	K																																																																									
1 st Grade Teacher Fidelity	1																																																																									
2 nd Grade Teacher Fidelity	2																																																																									
*Effect Size	N/A																																																																									
*Peer Review (Y/N)	N/A																																																																									

MOWR Review Committee finding:

Arizona Department of Education

Revised 4/17/24

-Will be added to the MOWR Core Reading Program List for two years as the study is 13 years old.

-Research is 13 years old. At 15 years, it will no longer be considered for review.

-The following DIBELS subtests showed no statistically significant results:

K composite (Pawtucket/Providence comparison)

K FSF (Pawtucket comparison)

K LNF (Pawtucket comparison)

1st ORF WCPM (Pawtucket comparison)