

Arizona Department of Education

The Audit Unit 1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19 Phoenix, Arizona 85007 602-364-4036

Average Daily Membership
Audit Report
Kingman Unified School District
Fiscal Years 2019, 2020 and 2021

Report Number—23-27 February 17, 2023



CONTACTING THE AUDIT UNIT

Angel Santiago, Audit Supervisor

Phone: 602-364-4061

Email: Angel.santiago@azed.gov

Fax: (602) 364-3264

Mail: 1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19

Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209

OBTAINING ADDITIONAL COPIES

To obtain additional copies of this report, please submit a formal request to the address below:

Arizona Department of Education—The Audit Unit 1535 W. Jefferson Street, Bin 19 Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209



Arizona Department of Education

Audit Unit

February 17, 2023

Gretchen Dorner, Superintendent Kingman Unified School District 3033 McDonald Ave. Kingman, AZ 86101

Dear Superintendent Dorner:

The Arizona Department of Education Audit Unit has conducted an audit of the Kingman Unified School District (District) Average Daily Membership (ADM) for Fiscal Years 2019, 2020 and 2021. The purpose of the audit was to address whether the District properly reported student enrollment, and to determine if it received the correct amount of Basic State Aid.

Auditors determined that the District incorrectly reported the enrollment data of 110 students, which resulted in its ADM being overstated by 76.16. As a result, the District was overfunded by \$344,133.54 which the District must repay to ADE.

We appreciate the cooperation and assistance provided by the District's administration during the course of the audit.

Sincerely,

Melissa Moreno, Chief Auditor

Mr Mu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction and background	Page 1
Scope and methodology	3
Finding 1: The District did not accurately report some student data resulting in an overpayment of \$344,133.54	a, 5
The District inaccurately reported some student data	5
The District failed to comply with statute and ADE guidelines	7
The District was overfunded by \$344,133.54	8
Recommendations	8
ADM and funding adjustments	9

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

		<u>Page</u>
Tables:		
1	Kingman Unified School District Total students, revenues, and expenditures Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021 (Unaudited)	2
2	Kingman Unified School District ADM adjustments due to enrollment data errors Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021	7
3	Kingman Unified School District ADM and funding adjustments Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021	8
4	Kingman Unified School District ADM and funding adjustments Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021	9

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Arizona Department of Education (ADE) Audit Unit has conducted an Average Daily Membership (ADM) audit of the Kingman Unified School District (District) pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) § 15-239. This audit focused on whether the District properly reported enrollment data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid for Fiscal Years (FY) 2019 through 2021.

Average Daily Membership audits of district and charter holder funding—Pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-239, ADE may conduct ADM audits, which help ensure the appropriate distribution of Basic State Aid provided annually to school districts and charter schools. School districts and charter schools receive Basic State Aid based on several factors related to student enrollment and attendance. To receive funding, school districts and charter schools report enrollment and attendance data to ADE. ADE processes that data, determines payment amounts according to the relevant statutory funding formulas and distributes payments to schools up to twelve times each year.

The ADM audit process determines whether payments were correct or if an adjustment is needed. The audit process compares the school district's or charter school's information reported to ADE's student data system to information found on the original records kept at the school. If auditors find that the school district's or charter school's reported information does not match the original documentation, the audit will calculate and report the funding adjustment needed to the school district's or charter school's Basic State Aid. These funding adjustments can be positive or negative, depending upon the audit findings. The audit findings are written and compiled into a report that is then issued to the audited entity.

Superintendent's legal notice links the audit and appeals processes—In addition to the report, the audited entity receives The Notice of Audit Findings and Required Reimbursement (Notice) that details the audit findings and determination of the Superintendent of Public Instruction (Superintendent) regarding adjustments to be made to the school district or charter school pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-915. The audited entity may appeal the Superintendent's decision in the Notice.

Opportunity to appeal the audit—A.R.S. § 41-1092.03 provides the audited school district or charter school that disagrees with the Superintendent's decision in the Notice with the opportunity to file a formal appeal within thirty (30) days after the report was issued. If an appeal is filed, the school district or charter school and ADE may reach agreement in an informal settlement conference. If an agreement is not reached at the informal settlement conference, the appeal will be adjudicated by the Office of Administrative Hearings.

Funding adjustment process and timeframes—When the Notice is finally settled or adjudicated, if ADE has determined that a school district or charter school received an incorrect amount of Basic State Aid, A.R.S. § 15-915 directs that corrections to schools' funding be made in the current budget year. In case of hardship, schools may request that the Superintendent

allow a correction to be made partly in the current budget year and partly in the following budget year.

In addition, ADE will adjust the District's budget capacity if required. ADE School Finance Memorandum 13-011 summarizes the budget capacity adjustment authorized by statute:

A.R.S. §15-915, as amended by Laws 2012, Chapter 357, Section 3, requires the superintendent of public instruction, when it is determined that state aid or budget limits have been calculated in error, within the prior 3 years, to make corrections to budget limits and state aid in the current year. (Hardship application may be approved by the superintendent). Effective for audits initiated during FY2013 and continuing in subsequent years, corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid (when applicable) will be made.

District information—The District, located in Kingman, Arizona, offered instruction in grades Preschool through 12 during the fiscal years audited. They operated two high schools, two middle schools, seven elementary schools, etc. Table 1 presents the District's unaudited student, staffing and financial information for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.

Table 1

Kingman Unified School District

Total students, revenues, and expenditures

Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021

(Unaudited)

	2019	2020	2021
Students Enrolled	7,053	7,082	6,625
Number of Teachers	352	327	327
Revenue			
Local	\$27,125,294	\$23,423,622	\$24,941,891
Intermediate	\$3,911,361	\$3,964,580	\$3,891,837
State	\$32,697,657	\$31,221,238	\$29,421,977
Federal	\$7,832,066	\$6,950,195	\$13,051,635
Total Revenues	\$71,566,378	\$65,559,636	\$71,307,340
Total Expenditures	<u>\$57,048,219</u>	<u>\$60,613,357</u>	<u>\$69,301,415</u>

Source: Annual Report of the Arizona Superintendent of Public Instruction for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The audit focused on whether the District accurately reported its data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid in accordance with statutes, the Uniform System of Financial Records for Arizona School Districts (USFR) and its own policies and procedures for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.

To conduct this audit, auditors used a variety of methods, including examining District and ADE records to review 2,290 of 22,872 students over the three fiscal years audited. Adjustments to ADM are based solely on those identified students that the auditors evaluated further and are not extrapolated to create findings for the entire student population. Auditors also reviewed state statutes and District policies and procedures and interviewed District management and staff. Specifically:

- Enrollment data Auditors reviewed student schedules, enrollment histories and attendance data to determine if the enrollment data reported to ADE was correct. Auditors compared the entry and exit dates to determine if an adjustment was necessary. Auditors also reviewed absences to ensure that they were reported correctly and made adjustments if they were needed.
- FTE calculations Auditors reviewed the bell schedules and student schedules to determine whether the District reported the correct full-time enrollment (FTE) data to ADE. Auditors calculated the FTE based on the classes and time a student was enrolled in the District and compared the FTE to what was reported to ADE. When the FTE was incorrect, auditors made an adjustment.
- **Student Files** Auditors reviewed student files to ensure that they maintained required documentation such as birth certificates, immunization records, and supporting residency documentation. No material findings were identified for this area.
- Instructional hours Auditors reviewed the bell schedules and calendars for the District for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021. The total instructional hours offered for each grade met the minimum required by statute for each of the three fiscal years audited.
- Distance Learning Plans Auditors reviewed the Distance Learning Plans (DLP) for FY2021 that were used to provide education to students. In addition, auditors reviewed the percentage of learning that was distance learning or in person to determine if this was reported correctly. No findings were identified for this area.
- SPED Data Auditors determined whether an adjusted student had also been funded for a special education (SPED) category. When students with a special education category also had an adjustment, auditors made an adjustment to the

special education weight as well.

• **Limiting** – Auditors reviewed the total ADM for each enrolled student to ensure that they were appropriately limited by ADE's system. No findings were identified for this area.

The Audit Unit expresses its appreciation to the District's administration and staff members for their cooperation and assistance during the course of the audit.

FINDING 1: THE DISTRICT DID NOT ACCURATELY REPORT SOME STUDENT DATA, RESULTING IN AN OVERPAYMENT OF \$344,133.54

Auditors determined that the District inaccurately reported the student data for 110 students for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021. Specifically, auditors found that 33 students had an incorrectly reported FTE, 30 students were not eligible for homebound, 18 students had 10 or more consecutive unexcused absences, 16 students had excessive absences, eight students were reported with incorrect enrollment dates, three students had not attended the District, and two preschool students were not eligible for funding. As a result of these errors, the District's ADM was overreported by 76.16 As a result, the District was overfunded by \$344,133.54 in Basic State Aid. According to A.R.S. § 15-915, ADE needs to recover these monies from the District.

The District inaccurately reported some student data

The District inaccurately reported 110 students' enrollment data to ADE, which resulted in the District's ADM being overstated by 76.16.

According to A.R.S. § 15-901, for a high school student to be reported as a 1.0 FTE, the student must be enrolled in at least four subjects which meet at least 123 hours annually each and total at least 720 instructional hours for the year. A student who does not meet these requirements is considered a part-time student and their FTE status must be reduced based on the number of actual instructional hours provided and courses enrolled. 1. A.R.S. § 15-901 also states homebound students must have medical certification and must receive at least 4 hours of instruction per week to be considered full-time. In addition, A.R.S. § 15- 901 states that a student with 10 consecutive unexcused absences must be withdrawn and beginning in FY2019, School Finance Manual (G) states that students who have reached the 10% threshold for cumulative absences (excused or unexcused) based on the number of instructional calendar days at their school and incur 10 or more consecutive absences will generate non-fundable ADM intervals. Finally, according to ADE External Guideline and Procedures GE-17 and A.R.S. § 15-901, with the exception of pre-enrolled students, the enrollment dates for a student are the first day of actual attendance and the last day of actual attendance or excused absence. However, the District did not always adhere to these requirements. Specifically,

_

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-901, a full time student (1.0 FTE) in grades 9 through 12 must be scheduled for and attending at least 720 hours of instruction and at least four subjects each of which meets for at least 123 hours annually; a 0.75 FTE student must be scheduled for at least 540 hours of instruction and at least three subjects each of which meets for at least 123 hours annually, a 0.50 FTE student must be scheduled for at least 360 hours of instruction and at least two subjects each of which meets for at least 123 hours annually and a 0.25 FTE student must be scheduled for at least 180 hours of instruction and at least one subject which meets for at least 123 hours annually.

for the students that were sampled:

- 33 students had an incorrect FTE reported. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 6.41.
- 30 students were not eligible for homebound due to the District not providing sufficient homebound instruction and medical certification documentation. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 17.20.
- 18 students had ten or more consecutive unexcused absences and should have been withdrawn. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 1.72.
- 16 students had excessive absences which resulted in a non-fundable period. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 5.12.
- 8 students were reported with incorrect enrollment dates. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 1.03
- 3 students were reported as attended but did not actually attend the District. As a result, the District's ADM was overreported by 0.11.
- 2 preschool students were reported; however, they were not eligible for funding. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 0.33.
- 34 out of the students that had data reported incorrectly were also funded with a SPED category. As a result, the weighted SPED ADM for the District was overreported by 44.24.

As shown in Table 2 (see page 7), data reporting errors resulted in an ADM overstatement of 76.16 for the three fiscal years audited.

Table 2

Kingman Unified School District ADM adjustments due to enrollment data errors Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021

	2019	2020	2021	Total
Incorrect FTE	5.06	0.34	1.01	6.41
Homebound	10.99	0.62	5.59	17.20
10-day Absence	-	-	1.72	1.72
Excessive Absence	1.81	3.31	-	5.12
Incorrect Enrollment Dates	-	-	1.03	1.03
Did not attend	-	0.01	0.10	0.11
Preschool Eligibility	0.34	-	(0.01)	0.33
SPED	32.91	11.33	-	44.24
Total	<u>51.11</u>	<u>15.61</u>	9.44	<u>76.16</u>

Source: Auditor analysis of District records, ADE data for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021

The District failed to comply with statute and ADE guidelines

The District did not follow statute and ADE guidelines when calculating and reporting student FTE or student enrollment data.

Auditors determined that 33 of the District's students did not meet the statutory and ADE guideline requirements for full time enrollment (FTE). According to analysis of the District's bell schedule and calendar for the District's high school, auditors determined that as long as a student was enrolled in four courses for each of the fiscal years audited, they would receive enough hours and subjects to be considered full time. However, the FTE that was reported for 33 students was not correct based on the total hours or number of courses the students were enrolled in. As a result, the District overreported the FTE for 33 students.

The District also misreported 30 students as being homebound. According to ARS § 15-901, a homebound student must be certified by a medical doctor as being unable to attend regular classes for a period of not less than three school months during a school year. A homebound student can be counted as in attendance for each day in a week where at least four hours of instruction were provided. However, the District incorrectly reported the 30 students as being homebound without the proper certification and/or did not provide at least four hours of instruction.

Additionally, the District misreported the enrollment data of 47 students. According to ARS § 15-901 and ADE guidelines, ADM is based on the first 100 days of the school year, using the enrollment date and the withdrawal date of the student. Further, A.R.S. § 15- 901 states that a student with 10 consecutive unexcused absences must be withdrawn and beginning in FY2019, School Finance Manual (G) states that students who have reached the 10% threshold for cumulative absences and incur 10 or more consecutive absences will generate non-fundable ADM intervals. The District incorrectly reported the entry/exit dates of eight students, did not withdraw 18 students with 10 or more absences, generated a non-

fundable interval for 16 students, reported three students to ADE that did not attend, and reported two preschool students that were not eligible for funding.

In the future, the District must ensure it complies with statute and ADE guidelines to properly report FTE, student enrollments and homebound students.

The District was overfunded by \$344,133.54

Auditors determined that the District did not receive the correct amount of Basic State Aid due to the inaccurate student data reported to ADE for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021. The student data incorrectly reported by the District resulted in its ADM being overstated by 76.16. As a result, the District was overfunded by \$344,133.54 in Basic State Aid for the three fiscal years audited which ADE must recoup from the District pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-915.

Table 3

Kingman Unified School District
ADM and funding adjustments
Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021

	ADM Adjustment	Total
2019	51.11	\$223,774.11
2020	15.61	\$69,064.97
2021	9.44	\$51,294.46
Total	76.16	\$344,133.54

Source: Auditor analysis of District and ADE records for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.

Recommendations:

- 1. The District must repay to ADE \$344,133.54 in Basic State Aid due to incorrectly reported student data.
- 2. The District needs to ensure that it properly reports students' FTE pursuant to statute and ADE guidelines.
- 3. The District must collect required medical certification documentation and provide education services to homebound student for a minimum of four hours per week for students certified as Homebound pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-901.
- 4. The District must reconcile to ensure that enrollment dates are reported accurately pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-901.

ADM AND FUNDING ADJUSTMENTS

A.R.S. § 15-915 requires that ADE makes corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid. ADE's School Finance Unit's Memo 13-011 informs LEAs of these statutory requirements:

A.R.S. §15-915, as amended by Laws 2012, Chapter 357, Section 3, requires the superintendent of public instruction, when it is determined that state aid or budget limits have been calculated in error, within the prior 3 years, to make corrections to budget limits and state aid in the current year. (Hardship application may be approved by the superintendent). Effective for audits initiated during 2013 and continuing in subsequent years, corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid (when applicable) will be made.

Budget capacity adjustment required—The District must adjust its budget capacity for the three fiscal years audited. Budget capacity adjustment calculations for the District will be made by ADE once the audit is finalized.

Basic State Aid adjustment of \$344,133.54 required to be paid to ADE—Auditors identified an overall funding adjustment of \$344,133.54 for the three fiscal years audited due to inaccurate student enrollment.

Table 4 lists the ADM adjustments and the associated Basic State Aid adjustments for the District for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.

Kingman Unified School District
ADM and funding adjustments

Table 4

Fiscal years 2019, 2020 and 2021

	2019	2020	2021	Total
ADM adjustment	51.11	15.61	9.44	76.16
Funding adjustment	\$233,774.11	\$69,064.97	\$51,294.46	\$344,133.54

Source: Auditor analysis of ADE and District student and financial data for FY2019, FY2020 and FY2021.