



## Arizona Department of Education

The Audit Unit

1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19

Phoenix, Arizona 85007

602-364-4036

# Average Daily Membership Audit Report Sacaton Elementary District Fiscal Years 2017, 2018 and 2019

Report Number—20-38

May 26, 2020



**CONTACTING  
THE AUDIT UNIT**

Taylor MacNamara, Audit Manager

Phone: (602) 364-4063

Email: Taylor.MacNamara@azed.gov

Fax: (602) 364-3264

Mail: 1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19  
Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209

---

**OBTAINING ADDITIONAL COPIES**

*To obtain additional copies of this report, please submit a formal request to the address below:*

Arizona Department of Education—The Audit Unit  
1535 W. Jefferson Street, Bin 19  
Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209

---



## Arizona Department of Education

Audit Unit

May 26, 2020

Dr. Cheryl Paul, Superintendent  
Sacaton Elementary District  
92 Skill Center Rd  
Sacaton, AZ 85147

Dear Superintendent Paul:

The Arizona Department of Education Audit Unit has conducted an audit of the Sacaton Elementary District (District) Average Daily Membership (ADM) for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019. The purpose of the audit was to address whether the District properly reported student enrollment, and to determine if it received the correct amount of Basic State Aid.

Auditors determined that the District had improperly reported some student enrollment data in fiscal year 2017, 2018 and 2019, which resulted in an underpayment of Basic State Aid. In total, the District was underfunded Basic State Aid by \$11,714.34 due to an ADM understatement of 6.17. Additionally, auditors determined that the District failed to properly maintain some required documentation in student cumulative files.

We appreciate the cooperation and assistance provided by the District's administration during the course of the audit.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Melissa Moreno".

Melissa Moreno,  
Chief Auditor

**Kathy Hoffman, Superintendent of Public Instruction**

1535 West Jefferson Street • Phoenix Arizona 85007 • (602) 542-5460 • [www.azed.gov](http://www.azed.gov)

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

	<u>Page</u>
<b>Introduction and background .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Scope and methodology.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Finding 1: The District did not accurately report some student data, resulting in an underpayment of \$11,714.34 .....</b>	<b>4</b>
The District inaccurately reported some student data.....	4
The District must properly reconcile its enrollment data with ADE .....	5
The District was underfunded by \$11,714.34 .....	5
Recommendations .....	6
<b>Finding 2: The District did not properly maintain some student records as required by statute and guideline .....</b>	<b>7</b>
The District did not properly maintain student file documentation .....	7
Recommendation .....	8
<b>ADM and funding adjustments .....</b>	<b>9</b>

# TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

---

	<u>Page</u>
<b>Tables:</b>	
1 Sacaton Elementary District Total students, revenues and expenditures Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019 (Unaudited) .....	2
2 Sacaton Elementary District ADM adjustments due to enrollment data errors Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.....	5
3 Sacaton Elementary District ADM and funding adjustments Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.....	6
4 Sacaton Elementary District Student cumulative file documentation Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.....	8
5 Sacaton Elementary District ADM and funding adjustments Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.....	9

# INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

---

The Arizona Department of Education (ADE) Audit Unit has conducted an Average Daily Membership (ADM) audit of the Sacaton Elementary District (District) pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) § 15-239. This audit focused on whether the District properly reported enrollment data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid for Fiscal Years (FY) 2017 through 2019.

***Average Daily Membership audits of district and charter holder funding***—Pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-239, ADE may conduct ADM audits, which help ensure the appropriate distribution of Basic State Aid provided annually to school districts and charter schools. School districts and charter schools receive Basic State Aid based on several factors related to student enrollment and attendance. To receive funding, school districts and charter schools report enrollment and attendance data to ADE. ADE processes that data, determines payment amounts according to the relevant statutory funding formulas and distributes payments to schools up to twelve times each year.

The ADM audit process determines whether payments were correct or if an adjustment is needed. The audit process compares the school district's or charter school's information reported to ADE's student data system to information found on the original records kept at the school. If auditors find that the school district's or charter school's reported information does not match the original documentation, the audit will calculate and report the funding adjustment needed to the school district's or charter school's Basic State Aid. These funding adjustments can be positive or negative, depending upon the audit findings. The audit findings are written and compiled into a report that is then issued to the audited entity.

***Superintendent's legal notice links the audit and appeals processes***—In addition to the report, the audited entity receives The Notice of Audit Findings and Required Reimbursement (Notice) that details the audit findings and determination of the Superintendent of Public Instruction (Superintendent) regarding adjustments to be made to the school district or charter school pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-915. The audited entity may appeal the Superintendent's decision in the Notice.

***Opportunity to appeal the audit***—A.R.S. § 41-1092.03 provides the audited school district or charter school that disagrees with the Superintendent's decision in the Notice with the opportunity to file a formal appeal within thirty (30) days after the report was issued. If an appeal is filed, the school district or charter school and ADE may reach agreement in an informal settlement conference. If an agreement is not reached at the informal settlement conference, the appeal will be adjudicated by the Office of Administrative Hearings.

***Funding adjustment process and timeframes***—When the Notice is finally settled or adjudicated, if ADE has determined that a school district or charter school received an incorrect amount of Basic State Aid, A.R.S. § 15-915 directs that corrections to schools' funding be made

in the current budget year. In case of hardship, schools may request that the Superintendent allow a correction to be made partly in the current budget year and partly in the following budget year.

In addition, ADE will adjust the District’s budget capacity if required. ADE School Finance Memorandum 13-011 summarizes the budget capacity adjustment authorized by statute:

*A.R.S. §15-915, as amended by Laws 2012, Chapter 357, Section 3, requires the superintendent of public instruction, when it is determined that state aid or budget limits have been calculated in error, within the prior 3 years, to make corrections to budget limits and state aid in the current year. (Hardship application may be approved by the superintendent). Effective for audits initiated during FY2013 and continuing in subsequent years, corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid (when applicable) will be made.*

**District information**—The District, located in Sacaton, Arizona, offered instruction in preschool through 8<sup>th</sup> grade during the fiscal years audited. They operated one middle school and one elementary school. Table 1 presents the District’s unaudited student, staffing and financial information for FY 2017, FY 2018 and FY 2019.

**Table 1**

**Sacaton Elementary District  
Total students, revenues and expenditures  
Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019  
(Unaudited)**

	<b>2017</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>
<b>Students enrolled</b>	<b>581</b>	<b>554</b>	<b>640</b>
<b>Number of teachers</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>47</b>
<b>Revenue</b>			
Local	\$ 546,578	\$ 118,114	\$ 133,461
Intermediate	\$ 276,495	\$ 280,279	\$ 268,148
State	\$ 3,836,512	\$ 3,837,916	\$ 4,244,487
Federal	\$ 6,323,624	\$ 5,898,687	\$ 7,464,163
<b>Total revenues</b>	<b>\$ 10,983,209</b>	<b>\$ 10,134,996</b>	<b>\$ 12,110,259</b>
<b>Total expenditures</b>	<b>\$ 11,964,706</b>	<b>\$ 11,217,746</b>	<b>\$ 11,879,652</b>

Source: Annual Report of the Arizona Superintendent of Public Instruction for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.

## SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

---

The audit focused on whether the District accurately reported its data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid in accordance with statutes, the Uniform System of Financial Records for Arizona School Districts (USFR) and its own policies and procedures for FY 2017, FY 2018 and FY 2019.

To conduct this audit, auditors used a variety of methods, including examining District and ADE records to review 162 of 1,970 students over the three fiscal years audited. Adjustments to ADM are based solely on those identified students that the auditors evaluated further and are not extrapolated to create findings for the entire student population. Auditors also reviewed state statutes and District policies and procedures, and interviewed District management and staff. Specifically:

- **Enrollment data** – Auditors reviewed student schedules, enrollment histories and attendance data to determine if the enrollment data reported to ADE was correct. Auditors compared the enrollment dates and full-time enrollment (FTE) to determine if an adjustment was necessary. Auditors also reviewed absences to ensure that they were reported correctly and made adjustments if they were needed.
- **Student files** – Auditors reviewed student files to ensure that they maintained required documentation such as birth certificates, immunization records, and supporting residency documentation. Auditors identified files that did not contain all the documentation that was required to be kept in them by statute and ADE guidelines.
- **Instructional hours** – Auditors reviewed the bell schedules and calendars for the District for FY2017, FY2018 and FY2019. The total instructional hours offered for each grade met the minimum required by statute for each of the three fiscal years audited.
- **SPED data** – Auditors determined whether an adjusted student had also been funded for a special education (SPED) category. When students with a special education category also had an adjustment, auditors made an adjustment to the special education weight as well.

The Audit Unit expresses its appreciation to the District's administration and staff members for their cooperation and assistance during the course of the audit.

# **FINDING 1: THE DISTRICT DID NOT ACCURATELY REPORT SOME STUDENT DATA, RESULTING IN AN UNDERPAYMENT OF \$11,714.34**

---

Auditors determined that the District inaccurately reported the student data for 13 students for FY 2017, FY 2018 and FY 2019. Specifically, auditors found that seven students were in attendance that were not funded, three students were reported as homebound without the proper documentation, two students had incorrectly reported enrollment dates and one student had an incorrectly reported FTE. As a result of these errors, the District's ADM was underreported by 6.17 and the District was underfunded by \$11,714.34 in Basic State Aid. According to A.R.S. § 15-915, ADE needs to pay these monies to the District.

## **The District inaccurately reported some student data**

The District inaccurately reported 13 students' enrollment data to ADE, which resulted in the District's ADM being understated by 6.17.

According to ADE External Guideline and Procedures GE-17 and A.R.S. § 15-901, with the exception of pre-enrolled students, the enrollment dates for a student are the first day of actual attendance and the last day of actual attendance or excused absence. A.R.S. § 15-901 also states homebound students must have medical certification and must receive at least 4 hours of instruction per week to be considered full-time. However, the District did not always adhere to these requirements. Specifically, for the students that were sampled:

- 7 students attended the District but were not funded. As a result, the ADM for the District was underreported by 4.57.
- 3 students were reported as homebound but did not have the documentation to show services were provided. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 2.30.
- 2 students were reported with incorrect enrollment dates. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 0.41.
- 1 student had an incorrect FTE reported. As a result, the ADM for the District was overreported by 0.10.

- 7 of the students that had data reported incorrectly were also funded with a SPED category. As a result, the weighted SPED ADM for the District was underreported by 4.41.

As shown in Table 2, data reporting errors resulted in an ADM understatement of 6.17 for the three fiscal years audited.

**Table 2**

**Sacaton Elementary District  
ADM adjustments due to enrollment data errors  
Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019**

	<b>Attended</b>	<b>Homebound</b>	<b>Enrollment dates</b>	<b>FTE</b>	<b>SPED</b>	<b>Total</b>
2017	(4.07)	1.00	0.02	-	(4.42)	(7.47)
2018	(0.50)	-	-	0.10	-	(0.40)
2019	-	1.30	0.39	-	0.01	1.70
<b>Total</b>	<b>(4.57)</b>	<b>2.30</b>	<b>0.41</b>	<b>0.10</b>	<b>(4.41)</b>	<b>(6.17)</b>

Source: Auditor analysis of District records, ADE data for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.

**The District must properly reconcile its enrollment data with ADE**

The District can likely avoid errors in the future by ensuring it regularly and correctly reconciles its data to the data contained in ADE’s system. Additionally, the District must ensure that a process is in place that captures the proper FTE and enrollment dates of students to ensure proper funding and reporting of data. Finally, the District should retain homebound documentation as required by state record retention schedules. The District should review its reconciliation practices to ensure that its staff properly review the reports produced by ADE and reconcile them to the District’s SMS data to identify any discrepancies and correct any errors identified.

**The District was underfunded by \$11,714.34**

Auditors determined that the District did not receive the correct amount of Basic State Aid due to the inaccurate student data reported to ADE for FY 2017, FY 2018 and FY 2019. The student data incorrectly reported by the District resulted in its ADM being understated by 6.17. As a net result, as shown in Table 3 (see page 6), the District was underfunded by \$11,714.34 which ADE must pay to the District pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-915.

**Table 3**

**Sacaton Elementary District  
ADM and funding adjustments  
Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019**

	<b>ADM Adjustment</b>	<b>Total</b>
2017	(7.47)	\$(17,406.49)
2018	(0.40)	\$(2,768.76)
2019	1.70	\$8,460.91
<b>Total</b>	<b>(6.17)</b>	<b>\$(11,714.34)</b>

Source: Auditor analysis of District and ADE records for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.

**Recommendations:**

1. ADE must pay to the District \$11,714.34 in Basic State Aid due to incorrectly reported student data.
2. The District must ensure that homebound records are appropriately maintained as required by record retention schedules.
3. The District must reconcile to ensure that enrollment dates are reported accurately pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-901.
4. The District must ensure that it properly calculates and reports students' FTE pursuant to statute and ADE guidelines.

## **FINDING 2: THE DISTRICT DID NOT PROPERLY MAINTAIN SOME STUDENT RECORDS AS REQUIRED BY STATUTE AND GUIDELINE**

---

Auditors determined that the District failed to properly maintain residency, birth certificate and immunization documentation for some students as required by statute and ADE guidelines. The District did not properly maintain required documentation in some of its student cumulative files. In the future, the District should properly maintain these documents to ensure compliance with statute and ADE guidelines.

### **The District did not properly maintain student file documentation**

Auditors determined that the District failed to maintain residency documentation for some students as required by statute and ADE guidelines. According to A.R.S. § 15-802 and the ADE Arizona Residency Guideline, school districts and charter schools are required to maintain verifiable documentation of Arizona residency in the student's cumulative file. This documentation must be provided each time a student enrolls in a school district or charter school and reaffirmed during the annual registration process. The ADE Arizona Residency Guideline identifies an approved list of options a parent or legal guardian may provide to the school district or charter school to meet these requirements.

Auditors also determined that the District failed to maintain birth certificate documentation for one student as required by statute. According to A.R.S. § 15-828, a photocopy of the student's birth certificate or other reliable proof of the student's identity and age must be placed in the student's file.

In addition, auditors determined that the District failed to maintain immunization documentation for one student as required by statute. According to A.R.S. § 15-872, "A pupil shall not be allowed to attend school without submitting documentary proof to the school administrator unless the pupil is exempted from immunization pursuant to section 15-873."

The District did not maintain the proper documentation required by statute and ADE's residency guideline. Of the 75 students sampled, 37 of the student files did not have the proper residency documentation, one student did not have a birth certificate in their file and one student did not have immunization record documentation in their file. Table 4 (see page 8) lists the student file documentation maintained by the District for FY2017, FY2018 and FY2019.

**Table 4**

**Sacaton Elementary District  
Student cumulative file documentation  
Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019**

	<b>Total sampled</b>	<b>Missing residency documentation</b>	<b>Missing birth certificate</b>	<b>Missing immunization</b>
2017	25	16	1	-
2018	25	12	-	1
2019	25	9	-	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>

Source: Auditor analysis of District records for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.

In the future, the District must ensure that it complies with statute by collecting and maintaining in each student's cumulative file copies of verifiable residency, birth certificate documentation and immunization documentation as required by law.

**Recommendation:**

1. The District must comply with statute and collect and maintain in each student's cumulative file copies of verifiable residency, birth certificate and immunization documentation as required by law.

# ADM AND FUNDING ADJUSTMENTS

---

A.R.S. § 15-915 requires that ADE makes corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid. ADE’s School Finance Unit’s Memo 13-011 informs LEAs of these statutory requirements:

*A.R.S. §15-915, as amended by Laws 2012, Chapter 357, Section 3, requires the superintendent of public instruction, when it is determined that state aid or budget limits have been calculated in error, within the prior 3 years, to make corrections to budget limits and state aid in the current year. (Hardship application may be approved by the superintendent). Effective for audits initiated during 2013 and continuing in subsequent years, corrections for audit findings to both budget capacity and state aid (when applicable) will be made.*

**Budget capacity adjustment required**—The District must adjust its budget capacity for the three fiscal years audited. Budget capacity adjustment calculations for the District will be made by ADE once the audit is finalized.

**Basic State Aid adjustment of \$11,714.34 required to be paid to the District**—Auditors identified an overall funding adjustment of \$11,714.34 for the three fiscal years audited due to inaccurate student enrollment.

Table 5 lists the ADM adjustments and the associated Basic State Aid adjustments for the District for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.

**Table 5**

**Sacaton Elementary District  
ADM and funding adjustments  
Fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019**

	2017	2018	2019	Total
ADM adjustment	(7.47)	(0.40)	1.70	(6.17)
<b>Funding adjustment</b>	<b>\$(17,406.49)</b>	<b>\$(2,768.76)</b>	<b>\$8,460.91</b>	<b>\$(11,714.34)</b>

Source: Auditor analysis of ADE and District student and financial data for fiscal years 2017, 2018 and 2019.