2016 Joint Technical Education District (JTED) Report

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (ARS) § 15-393 (M)

Submitted by the Arizona Department of Education
Career & Technical Education Section

Carol G. Lippert
Associate Superintendent, High Academic Standards for Students

Arizona Department of Education
Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction Diane M. Douglas

2016 Joint Technical Education District (JTED) Report

SCOPE OF THE REPORT

Under the provisions of the Arizona Revised Statutes (ARS) § 15-393 (M), the Arizona Department of Education, Career & Technical Education (ADE-CTE) section is required to collect and analyze information submitted by each Joint Technical Education District (JTED) and make this information available to select individuals and groups as specified below. The enclosed information is based on the data which is available during the previous school year (FY2014-2015).

ARS § 15-393 (M) – On or before December 31 of each year, each joint technical education district shall submit a detailed report to the career and technical education division of the department of education. The career and technical education division of the department of education shall collect, summarize and analyze the data submitted by the joint districts, shall submit an annual report that summarizes the data submitted by the joint districts to the governor, the speaker of the house of representatives, the president of the senate and the state board of education and shall submit a copy of this report to the secretary of state. The data submitted by each joint technical education district shall include the following:

1) The average daily membership of the joint district.
2) The program listings and program descriptions of programs offered by the joint district, including the course sequences for each program.
3) The costs associated with each program offered by the joint district.
4) The completion rate for each program offered by the joint district. For the purposes of this paragraph, "completion rate" means the completion rate for students who are designated as concentrators in that program by the department of education under the career and technology approved plan.
5) The graduation rate from the school district of residence of students who have completed a program in the joint district.
6) A detailed description of the career opportunities available to students after completion of the program offered by the joint district.
7) A detailed description of the career placement of students who have completed the program offered by the joint district.
8) Any other data deemed necessary by the department of education to carry out its duties under this subsection.

The enclosed information is intended to be summative in nature and provide an overview of the data analysis for each component required by statute. ***In the event that more detailed information is required, links to source data and/or further information is included within each section of this report.***

For further information –

- Joint Technical Education Districts in Arizona (includes listing of member school districts)

SECTION 1 – JTED AVERAGE DAILY MEMBERSHIP

A comparison of the 2013-2014 and 2014-2015 final JTED Average Daily Membership (ADM) counts was conducted to determine whether these districts had experienced an increase or decrease in enrollment. Data, collected through the Student Accountability Information System (SAIS), was retrieved from the Arizona Department of Education's (ADE) School Finance website. During the 2013-2014 school year, the thirteen JTED districts had a total ADM count of 21,501.477. The total JTED ADM rose to 23,175.843 for the current year, which represents an increase of 7.79%, illustrating growth in the overall numbers of students attending JTEDs throughout Arizona. It should also be noted that the JTEDs are not reporting unfunded ADM for 9th graders, even though the requirement to do so remains in place per the ADE School Finance Unit.

The Central Arizona Valley Institute of Technology (CAVIT) had the greatest increase in ADM totaling 27.39%. Northeast Arizona Technological Institute of Vocational Education (NATIVE) also saw a significant increase in enrollment of 25.38%, as well as, Mountain Institute Joint Technical Education District (MIJTED) with 20.77%. The other JTED districts also experienced increases in their ADM counts. The overwhelming majority of public secondary schools that offer CTE in Arizona now belong to a JTED district.

It is recommended that the Arizona Department of Education continue to reiterate to the JTEDs the requirement to report their ninth grade ADM and absences. This reporting will allow for increased accuracy in the yearly analysis of the JTED's ADM and enrollment reporting in order to provide information related to costs and to bolster accountability.

For further information –

- Average Daily Membership for Joint Technical Education Districts

SECTION 2 – JTED PROGRAM & COURSE LISTINGS/DESCRIPTIONS

JTEDs and the ADE-CTE section utilize the following process to assure compliance with the requirements of §ARS 15-391:

- JTED Superintendents must submit annually (by June 30th) a signed Statement of Assurance, confirming that all programs/courses reported for JTED Average Daily Membership funding purposes meet the statutory requirements (see link for the JTED Statement of Assurance Instructions and Form below).
- ADE-CTE provides periodic program monitoring to ensure compliance with the requirements, utilizing a consistent monitoring instrument (see links below for further CTE Program Monitoring information).
- Annually, JTED Superintendents receive a listing of the career and technical education programs the ADE-CTE section has on record as programs offered to students in member districts and on central JTED campuses (see link below for the JTED Program Log). JTED administrators are required to review the log and make necessary corrections to ensure the listing of JTED program offerings is accurate. Courses can be added or deleted from the log any time during the year by completing and submitting the appropriate forms (see links below for JTED Program/Course Submission and JTED Program/Course Deletion forms).

To meet statutory requirements, a process was developed to review, provide technical assistance and monitor JTED programs. The JTED staff submits programs to be offered to the ADE-CTE section for review (utilizing the appropriate forms) which meet the following definition:

- A CTE Career Preparation Program is a coherent sequence of instruction determined through the use of state labor market data to be a high-skill, high-wage and/or high-demand career opportunity for students that delivers a set of prescribed state standards (see links that follow for further information on Labor Market Data and the CTE Program List). JTEDs submit their programs and each course contained within the program's sequence of instruction to ADE-CTE section for review (see links below for the CTE Program List and the CTE Program Descriptions and Course Sequence).

CTE Program Specialists, with expertise in the program content area, conduct reviews, provide technical assistance and monitor JTED submissions utilizing the CTE Program Monitoring Instrument.

An appeals process was established and approved by the Arizona State Board of Career and Technological Education for JTEDs who would like reconsideration of their unapproved courses. To date, no courses have been appealed (see link that follows for further information on the JTED Appeals Process).

During school year 2014-2015, JTEDs provided opportunities for students in 2,032 CTE programs consisting of 6,432 courses. A CTE program is required to have a minimum of two courses in the program sequence. Most CTE programs consist of three or more courses (see link that follows for further information regarding the JTED Program and Course Table).

During 2014-2015, the JTEDs reported offering 251 fewer CTE programs than were reported in the 2013-2014 school year (see link below for information on the JTED Program and Course Comparison Table).

For further information –

- JTED Statement of Assurance Instruction Page
- JTED Statement of Assurance Form
- CTE Program Monitoring Process
- CTE Program Monitoring Instrument
- JTED Program Log
- JTED Program/Course Add/Delete Submission Form
- Detailed Occupational Data For 2015 CTE Program List
- 2015 CTE Program List
- 2015 CTE Program Descriptions and Course Sequence
- JTED Course Appeals Process
- 2014-2015 JTED Program and Course Table
- JTED Program and Course Comparison Table: SY 2013-2014 and SY 2014-2015

SECTION 3 – JTED COURSE COSTS

The term "cost" was never defined, either specifically or in terms of the legislative intent, when §15-393 (M) was enacted. Cost data at the program or course level is neither reported nor collected by the ADE in a format usable for the purposes of this report. As a result, program cost information is provided to the ADE-CTE section in a format developed cooperatively with JTED representatives. The format is based on the current Arizona Uniform System of Financial Reporting (USFR) and Chart of Account expenditure codes (expenditures such as salaries, benefits, supplies etc…).

Any discussion of cost is complicated by the fact that JTED member districts typically receive state and federal grants, as well as, use other local funding for instructor salaries (a cost often supported by member districts).

Sources of funding include local tax levy revenues and State Aid, State Vocational Block Grant funding, Carl D. Perkins funding, tax credit contributions, gifts of equipment/supplies and other secondary sources of funding.

It is important to note that, with the exception of the East Valley Institute of Technology (EVIT), JTED member districts more typically do not apply for state and federal grant funds. Only funds received under local tax levy revenues and State Aid (Funding Account 596) are reported and compared in detail for the purposes of this report. These funds are considered to be those most under the control of a JTED and subject to the approved conditions of the Intergovernmental Agency Agreement (IGA) between each JTED and its member districts.

There is still a strong relationship between program and salary costs, with this being the only consistent category. The cost data reflects how most districts expend their JTED revenues to maintain on-going programs, not necessarily to create new programs. Teacher salaries and benefits are still the strongest indicator of total program costs.

For further information –

- 2014-2015 Cost Reporting Summaries by JTED

SECTION 4 – JTED STUDENT PROGRAM COMPLETION RATES

For JTED reporting purposes, the formula used to calculate program completion is as follows:

> **Numerator:** Number of CTE concentrators who completed the state-designated sequence of instruction in a JTED program and passed the technical skills assessment and left secondary education in the reporting year.
>
> - Divided By -
>
> **Denominator:** Number of CTE concentrators who completed the state-designated sequence of instruction in a JTED program and took the technical skills assessment and left secondary education in the reporting year.

A CTE concentrator is a JTED student who has earned two Carnegie Units in a state designated sequence of instruction as a part of an approved CTE program. In some programs the concentrator may need to take an additional Carnegie Unit to complete the industry standards for that program.

During 2014-2015, there were 60 programs available that had end of program technical assessments. Approved JTED programs were expected to assess all concentrators who were in the final course of a coherent sequence of instruction (if there was an assessment available for the program). Concentrators are only included in the count when they leave school (i.e. graduated or dropped out) and are unduplicated.

School districts report student concentrators annually, using the ADE-CTE online data system. Districts report the school of attendance, CTE program, SAIS identification number, birthdate and the number of Carnegie Units earned for each concentrator record. Every CTE program has a designated number of courses in the coherent sequence of instruction (either two or three courses). Once a concentrator record indicates the student has completed the minimum number of Carnegie Units, assessment results are expected. The data is confirmed by each district using a Concentrator Verification Report.

It should be noted that not all programs currently have an assessment, although new assessments are being developed annually as new programs are added. It is expected that once all programs have an assessment in place, the data will be more comprehensive. It is also important to note that not all students who qualify to take an assessment choose to do so.

A total of 11,123 students were considered concentrators by completing a coherent sequence of instruction in a JTED program. Three-quarters of these students also took one of the program assessments. Approximately 84% of the JTED student concentrators who took a program assessment also passed that assessment.

For further information –

- Program Completion Rates
- CTE Technical Skills Assessment
- Participation in the Final Assessment and Pass Rates for Spring 2015

SECTION 5 – JTED STUDENT GRADUATION RATES

For the purposes of this report, a CTE performance measure has been used as a means to define the term "graduation rate" and is reported to the federal government in the same format. The CTE graduation rate is determined in the following manner:

> **Numerator:** The total number of CTE concentrators who graduated from secondary education in the reporting year and were included as graduated in the state's computation of its graduation rate using the 2015 cohort year.
>
> - Divided By -
>
> **Denominator:** The total number of CTE concentrators who left secondary education (either graduated or not) in the reporting year and were included in the state's computation of its graduation rate using the 2015 cohort year.

The JTED graduation rate is calculated using approved programs offered at both onsite and offsite campuses. Schools report students as concentrators if they have completed at least two Carnegie Units in a program. The Student Accountability Information System (SAIS) is used to extract the "leave codes" for these students as they exit secondary education. Within the parameters identified above, the total Arizona concentrator's graduation rate in 2015 was 98.40% (which was taken from the FY 2015 Consolidated Annual Report). The statewide JTED concentrator's graduation rate during the same period was 98.54%, which is an increase of 1% over the previous year.

For further information –

- JTED Program Completion Rates

SECTION 6 – JTED STUDENT CAREER OPPORTUNITIES

The CTE Program List provides guidance for JTEDs in planning and implementing programs based on the information developed by the Arizona Department of Administration's Office of Employment & Population Statistics, in cooperation with the U.S. Department of Labor's Employment and Training Administration. **Please note this list is updated biennially**. The 2015 Detailed Occupational Data Within all Available Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) Codes provides specific wage and occupational detail on hundreds of occupations. The aggregated data by program was applied to all Arizona CTE programs with the same 4-digit CIP code. JTEDs use this specific data to develop CTE programs. Employment opportunities with the highest skills, highest wages and highest demand were prioritized and ranked for the FY2015 Arizona CTE CIP Ranked by Formula list.

A JTED may also request to have consideration given to specific local occupational needs that are not reflected on the overall state CTE Program List. These may be highly specialized local employment opportunities such as Mining Occupations, Power Plant Maintenance, Environmental Control Technologies Water Operator and others.

The ADE-CTE section identifies programs with the greatest career potential and opportunities, on a statewide basis, for Arizona's high school and community college students. These 71 programs are linked to course offerings via the FY 2015 Arizona CTE Program List. The list reflects those programs that offer opportunities for Arizona students to earn a livable wage in gainful employment in Arizona. The list takes three primary factors into consideration:

- High-demand occupations: current openings by specific occupation (including projected occupation growth)
- High-skills occupations: job knowledge, skill and ability (including academic abilities)
- High-wage occupations

The list includes several emerging occupational areas for which insufficient information is available (as indicated by the Labor Market Information Statistics for Arizona), however, several statewide reports were used to identify these critical emerging occupational areas. The occupational areas that were determined to be new and emerging for Arizona include:

- Engineering Science
- Bioscience

Career opportunities are emphasized through various classroom experiences within the CTE program. JTED students have a variety of resources available in order for them to increase awareness of career opportunities within the state and their own communities. JTED students have access to an online planning tool called the Arizona Career Information System (AzCIS) which provides current career and educational information for appropriate career planning/decision making. The data within the AzCIS is updated annually to reflect current market information, programs of study, postsecondary schools information, scholarships and other related information.

For further information –

- 2015 Arizona CTE Program List
- 2015 Detailed Occupational Data within All Available CIP Codes for CTE Program List
- 2015 Arizona CTE Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) Ranked by Formula

SECTION 7 – JTED STUDENT CAREER PLACEMENT

For the purposes of this report, a CTE performance measure has been used as a means to define the term "career placement" and is reported to the federal government in the same format. The extent of career placement is determined in the following manner:

> **Numerator:** The total number of CTE concentrators who graduated and were placed in a related placement in postsecondary education or advanced training, in military service or employment in the second quarter following the program year in which they left secondary education.
>
> - Divided By -
>
> **Denominator:** The total number of CTE concentrators who graduated in the reporting year.

A placement survey is conducted for CTE graduates from the previous school year and is reported the following year, no later than April 15th. This report includes the student's name, placement information and other relevant data for CTE concentrators. The placement survey reports three types of placements:

- Postsecondary Education or Advanced Training
- Military
- Employment

A student is reported as a concentrator after they have completed at least two Carnegie Units in a program. An example of a related placement for a student who completes a business program in high school would be enrollment in a college business program or current employment in a business related occupation. Analysis is focused on the per-student (unduplicated) related placement count. Student concentrators are only counted in the placement calculation if they were actually enrolled in a JTED approved program at a member school or in an offsite facility that is managed by the JTED.

The average related placement for all JTED student concentrators graduating in the 2015 reporting year was 66.60%, which is up from 66.57% the previous year.

There are many factors that can affect the rate of related placements for CTE graduate concentrators. Because JTEDs are regional, unemployment and a struggling economy can suppress the rate of placements in some regions of the state. Higher unemployment rates (and other socioeconomic factors) make it harder for students to remain in school or compete for jobs when demand is at its highest.

It is important to note that in a small district, a marginal increase or decrease in graduation numbers can impact formula outcomes and make the shift appear more noteworthy than is warranted. It is not uncommon for JTED member districts that are small in size to experience this problem.

Related placements can also be influenced by the age of a program. Generally, a new program will not have related placements for two years, depending on the coherent sequence of courses required to teach all standards for the program. Also, the introduction of new programs can result in students migrating away from existing programs and moving into the new offerings.

For additional information –

- JTED Related Placement Data