



Arizona Department of Education

The Audit Unit

1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19

Phoenix, Arizona 85007

602-364-4061

Average Daily Membership Audit Report Pointe Educational Services Fiscal Years 2013, 2014 and 2015

Report Number—16-32

June 24, 2016



**CONTACTING
THE AUDIT UNIT**

Matthew D. Boucher, Audit Manager

Phone: (602) 542-8815

Email: Matt.Boucher@azed.gov

Fax: (602) 364-2334

Mail: 1535 W. Jefferson St., Bin 19
Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209

OBTAINING ADDITIONAL COPIES

To obtain additional copies of this report, please submit a formal request to the address below:

Arizona Department of Education—The Audit Unit
1535 W. Jefferson Street, Bin 19
Phoenix, AZ 85007-3209



State of Arizona
Department of Education
The Audit Unit
1535 W. Jefferson St, Bin 19 • Phoenix, AZ 85007
Phone (602) 364-4061 Fax (602) 542-2734

Diane Douglas
Superintendent of
Public Instruction

June 24, 2016

Jody Johnson, Superintendent
Pointe Educational Services
5940 W. Union Hills Dr., Ste. B-100
Phoenix, AZ 85308

Dear Ms. Johnson,

The Arizona Department of Education Audit Unit has conducted an audit of the Pointe Educational Services (School) Average Daily Membership (ADM) for Fiscal Years 2013, 2014 and 2015. The purpose of the audit was to address whether the School properly reported student enrollment to determine if it received the correct amount of Basic State Aid.

Auditors determined that the School did not accurately report some students' FTE status, which resulted in an overstatement of 9.31 ADM and an overfunding of \$42,671.79 in Basic State Aid, which must be repaid to ADE as required by statute.

We appreciate the cooperation and assistance provided by the School's administration during the course of the audit.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Lisa Eddy".

Lisa Eddy,
Chief Auditor

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Introduction and Background	1
Scope and Methodology	3
Finding 1: The School Did Not Accurately Report Some Students' FTE Resulting in an Underfunding of \$42,671.79	4
The School Inaccurately Reported Some Students' FTE	4
The School Must Properly Calculate and Report Student FTE Status.....	5
The School Was Overfunded by \$42,671.79	5
Recommendations	6
ADM and Funding Adjustments	7
Tables:	
1 Pointe Educational Services Total Students, Revenues and Expenditures FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015 (Unaudited)	2
2 Pointe Educational Services ADM Adjustments Due to FTE Status Errors FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.....	5

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

	<u>Page</u>
3 Pointe Educational Services ADM and Funding Adjustments Due to FTE Status Errors FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.....	6
4 Pointe Educational Services ADM and Funding Adjustments FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.....	7

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Arizona Department of Education (ADE) Audit Unit has conducted an Average Daily Membership (ADM) audit of the Pointe Educational Services (School) pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) § 15-239. This audit focused on whether the School properly reported enrollment data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid for FY2013 through FY2015.

Average Daily Membership audits of district and charter holder funding—Pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-239, ADE may conduct ADM audits, which help ensure the appropriate distribution of Basic State Aid provided annually to school districts and charter schools. School districts and charter schools receive Basic State Aid based on several factors related to student enrollment and attendance. To receive funding, school districts and charter schools report enrollment and attendance data to ADE. ADE processes that data, determines payment amounts according to the relevant statutory funding formulas and distributes payments to schools up to twelve times each year.

The ADM audit process determines whether payments were correct or if an adjustment is needed. The audit process compares the school district or charter school's information reported to ADE's student data system, the Student Accountability Information System (SAIS), to information found on the original records kept at the school. If auditors find that the school district or charter school's reported information does not match the original documentation, the audit will calculate and report the funding adjustment needed to the school district's or charter school's Basic State Aid. These funding adjustments can be positive or negative, depending upon the audit findings. The audit findings are written and compiled into a report that is then issued to the audited entity.

Superintendent's legal notice links the audit and appeals processes—In addition to the report, the audited entity receives The Notice of Audit Findings and Required Reimbursement (Notice) that details the audit findings and determination of the Superintendent of Public Instruction (Superintendent) regarding adjustments to be made to the school district or charter school pursuant to A.R.S. § 15-915. The audited entity may appeal the Superintendent's decision in the Notice.

Opportunity to appeal the audit—A.R.S. § 41-1092.03 provides the audited school district or charter school that disagrees with the Superintendent's decision in the Notice with the opportunity to file a formal appeal within thirty (30) days after the report was issued. If an appeal is filed, the school district or charter school and ADE may reach agreement in an informal settlement conference. If an agreement is not reached at the informal settlement conference, the appeal will be adjudicated by the Office of Administrative Hearings.

Funding adjustment process and timeframes—When the Notice is finally settled or adjudicated, if ADE has determined that a school district or charter school received an incorrect amount of Basic State Aid, A.R.S. § 15-915 directs that corrections to schools' funding be made in the current budget year. In case of hardship, schools may request that the Superintendent allow a correction to be made partly in the current budget year and partly in the following budget year.

School's information—The School is located in Glendale, Arizona. In FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015, the School offered instruction in grades KG through 12. Table 1 presents the School's unaudited student, staffing and financial information for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

Table 1

**Pointe Educational Services
Total Students, Revenues and Expenditures
FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015
(Unaudited)**

	FY2013	FY2014	FY2015
Students Enrolled	1,642	1,630	1,579
Number of Teachers	66	65	61
Revenue			
Local	\$ 609,758	\$ 716,599	\$ 692,037
County	-	-	-
State	9,768,076	10,100,117	9,986,024
Federal	155,576	150,755	190,387
Total Revenues	<u>10,533,410</u>	<u>10,967,471</u>	<u>10,868,448</u>
Total Expenditures	<u>\$ 9,637,516</u>	<u>\$ 10,076,158</u>	<u>\$ 10,204,737</u>

Source: Annual Report of the Arizona Superintendent of Public Instruction for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The audit focused on whether the School accurately reported its data to ADE and received the correct amount of Basic State Aid in accordance with statutes, the Uniform System of Financial Records for Arizona Charter Schools (USFRCS) and its own policies and procedures for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

To conduct this audit, auditors used a variety of methods, including examining School and SAIS records for enrollment. Auditors also reviewed state statutes and School policies and procedures, and interviewed School management and staff. Specifically:

- **Instructional hours**—Auditors reviewed the bell schedules and calendars for the charter school for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015. The total instructional hours offered for each grade met the minimum required by statute for each of the three fiscal years audited. No findings were identified for this area.
- **Enrollment data**—Auditors compared SAIS data to the School’s SMS and identified 303 students for review. Auditors obtained the student profiles from the School’s SMS and reviewed them to determine if the enrollment data reported to ADE was correct. Auditors compared the entry and exit dates to the student profiles to determine if an adjustment was necessary; no findings were identified for this area. In addition, auditors reviewed the student schedules for all sampled high school students to determine if the full time equivalency (FTE) reported to ADE was correct. Depending on the number of classes needed to have a 1.0 FTE, auditors recalculated the actual FTE for the students based on the number of courses the students were taking during the year. When the audited FTE was different from the reported FTE for a student, auditors recalculated the ADM and made appropriate adjustments to the funded ADM.
- **SPED Data**—Additionally, auditors determined whether an adjusted student had also been funded for one of the special education categories. Auditors determined that there were no special education adjustments.
- **Limiting**—Auditors reviewed the total ADM for each enrolled student to ensure that they were appropriately limited by SAIS. No findings were identified for this area.

The Audit Unit expresses its appreciation to Pointe Educational Services’ administration and staff members for their cooperation and assistance throughout the audit.

FINDING 1: THE SCHOOL DID NOT ACCURATELY REPORT SOME STUDENTS' FTE RESULTING IN AN OVERFUNDING OF \$42,671.79

Auditors determined that the School inaccurately reported the FTE status for 74 students for the three fiscal years audited. Specifically, auditors determined that 74 students were reported with an incorrect FTE. As a result of this error, the School's ADM was overstated by 9.31 for the fiscal years audited. Due to the inaccurate FTE statuses, the School was overfunded by \$42,671.79 in Basic State Aid, which according to A.R.S. § 15-915, the School must repay to ADE.

The School Inaccurately Reported Some Students' FTE

Auditors determined that the School inaccurately reported 74 students' FTE to ADE, which resulted in the School's ADM being overstated by 9.31. According to A.R.S. § 15-901¹, a high school student must be enrolled in at least 720 instructional hours annually in an instructional program of at least four or more subjects, each of which, if taught each school day for the minimum number of days required in a school year would meet a minimum of 123 hours annually. However, the School did not always adhere to these requirements. Specifically, 74 students were reported to SAIS as full-time students without having met the criteria established in Statute, which resulted in the School's ADM being overstated by 9.31.

As shown in Table 2 (see page 5), this data reporting error resulted in a net ADM overstatement of 9.31 for the three fiscal years audited.

¹ A.R.S. § 15-901 states that full-time student means: For high schools, a student enrolled in at least an instructional program of four or more subjects, each of which, if taught each school day for the minimum number of days required in a school year, would meet a minimum of one hundred twenty-three hours a year, or the equivalent, that meets for a total of at least seven hundred twenty hours for a one hundred eighty day school year. The average daily membership of a full-time high school student shall be 1.0 if the student is enrolled in at least four subjects that meet at least seven hundred twenty hours for a one hundred eighty day school year. Fractional student means: For high schools, the average daily membership of a part-time high school student shall be 0.75 if the student is enrolled in an instructional program of three subjects that meet at least five hundred forty hours for a one hundred eighty day school year. The average daily membership of a part-time high school student shall be 0.5 if the student is enrolled in an instructional program of two subjects that meet at least three hundred sixty hours for a one hundred eighty day school year. The average daily membership of a part-time high school student shall be 0.25 if the student is enrolled in an instructional program of one subject that meets at least one hundred eighty hours for a one hundred eighty day school year.

Table 2

**Pointe Educational Services
ADM Adjustments Due to FTE Status Errors
FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015**

	FY2013	FY2014	FY2015	Total
Incorrect FTE	4.66	2.52	2.12	9.31

Source: Auditor analysis of School records and SAIS data for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

**The School Must Properly Calculate
And Report Student FTE Status**

The School can likely avoid errors in the future by ensuring it properly evaluates the bell schedules and calendars each year to ensure each period of instruction intended to be counted toward a student's FTE status meets the requirements prescribed in Statute and ADE Guidelines.

**The School Was
Overfunded by \$42,671.79**

Auditors determined that the School did not receive the correct amount of Basic State Aid due to the inaccurate FTE data reported to ADE for the three fiscal years audited. The FTE data errors reported by the School resulted in its ADM being overstated by 9.31. As a result, the School was overfunded by \$42,671.79 in Basic State Aid, which must be repaid by the School to ADE as required by A.R.S. § 15-915. Table 3 (see page 6) shows the ADM and funding adjustments required for the three fiscal years audited.

Table 3

**Pointe Educational Services
ADM and Funding Adjustments Due to
FTE Status Errors
FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015**

Fiscal Year	ADM Adjustment	Net Funding Adjustment
2013	4.66	\$ 18,145.63
2014	2.52	16,346.40
<u>2015</u>	<u>2.12</u>	<u>8,179.76</u>
Total	9.31	\$ 42,671.79

Source: Auditor analysis of School records and SAIS data for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

Recommendations:

1. The School must repay the ADE \$42,671.79 in Basic State Aid due to incorrectly reported FTE status enrollment data.
2. The School must comply with A.R.S. § 15-901 when calculating and reporting FTE status.

ADM and Funding Adjustments

Auditors identified an overall funding decrease of \$42,671.79 for the three fiscal years audited due to inaccurate student FTE status data as reported by the School.

Table 4 lists the ADM adjustments and the associated Basic State Aid adjustments for the School for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.

Table 4

**Pointe Educational Services
ADM and Funding Adjustments
FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015**

	FY2013		FY2014		FY2015		Total
	ADM	Funding	ADM	Funding	ADM	Funding	
Funding Adjustment	4.66	\$ 18,145.63	2.52	\$ 16,346.40	2.12	\$ 8,179.76	\$42,671.79

Source: Auditor analysis of SAIS and School student and financial data for FY2013, FY2014 and FY2015.